

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORKIN RE WORLD TRADE CENTER  
DISASTER SITE LITIGATION

ROBERT BUTLER AND GIOVANNI BUTLER

Plaintiffs,

- against -

A RUSSO WRECKING, ET. AL.,

SEE ATTACHED RIDER,

Defendants.

**21 MC 100 (AKH)****DOCKET NO.****CHECK-OFF ("SHORT FORM")  
COMPLAINT  
RELATED TO THE  
MASTER COMPLAINT****PLAINTIFF(S) DEMAND A TRIAL BY  
JURY**

By Order of the Honorable Alvin K. Hellerstein, United States District Judge, dated June 22, 2006, ("the Order"), Amended Master Complaints for all Plaintiffs were filed on August 18, 2006.

**NOTICE OF ADOPTION**

All headings and paragraphs in the Master Complaint are applicable to and are adopted by the instant Plaintiff(s) as if fully set forth herein in addition to those paragraphs specific to the individual Plaintiff(s), which are listed below. These are marked with an "✓" if applicable to the instant Plaintiff(s), and specific case information is set forth, as needed, below.

Plaintiffs, ROBERT BUTLER AND GIOVANNI BUTLER, by his/her/their attorneys WORBY GRONER EDELMAN & NAPOLI BERN, LLP, complaining of Defendant(s), respectfully allege:

**I. PARTIES****A. PLAINTIFF(S)**

1.  Plaintiff, ROBERT BUTLER (hereinafter the "Injured Plaintiff"), is an individual and a citizen of New York residing at 42 Saterlee Street, Staten Island, NY 10307-.

(OR)

2. Alternatively,  \_\_\_\_\_ is the \_\_\_\_\_ of Decedent \_\_\_\_\_, and brings this claim in his (her) capacity as \_\_\_\_\_ of the Estate of \_\_\_\_\_.

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

3.  Plaintiff, Giovanni Butler (hereinafter the "Derivative Plaintiff"), is a citizen of New York residing at 42 Saterlee Street, Staten Island, NY 10307-, and has the following relationship to the Injured Plaintiff:

SPOUSE at all relevant times herein, is and has been lawfully married to Plaintiff ROBERT BUTLER, and brings this derivative action for her (his) loss due to the injuries sustained by her husband (his wife), Plaintiff ROBERT BUTLER.

Parent  Child  Other: \_\_\_\_\_

4. In the period from 9/11/2001 to 4/11/2002 the Injured Plaintiff worked for New York Police Department (NYPD) as a Detective at:

*Please be as specific as possible when filling in the following dates and locations*

The World Trade Center Site

Location(s) (i.e., building, quadrant, etc.) \_\_\_\_\_

From on or about 9/11/2001 until 4/11/2002;

Approximately 12 hours per day; for

Approximately 20 days total.

The New York City Medical Examiner's Office

From on or about \_\_\_\_\_ until \_\_\_\_\_,

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ hours per day; for

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ days total.

The Fresh Kills Landfill

From on or about 9/11/2001 until 4/1/2002;

Approximately 12 hours per day; for

Approximately 20 days total.

The Barge

From on or about \_\_\_\_\_ until \_\_\_\_\_;

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ hours per day; for

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ days total.

Other\*: For injured plaintiffs who worked at

Non-WTC Site building or location. The injured plaintiff worked at the address/location, for the dates alleged, for the hours per day, for the total days, and for the employer, as specified below:

From on or about \_\_\_\_\_ until \_\_\_\_\_;

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ hours per day; for

Approximately \_\_\_\_\_ days total;

Name and Address of Non-WTC Site  
Building/Worksite: \_\_\_\_\_

\*Continue this information on a separate sheet of paper if necessary. If more space is needed to specify "Other" locations, please annex a separate sheet of paper with the information.

## 5. Injured Plaintiff

Was exposed to and breathed noxious fumes on all dates, at the site(s) indicated above;

Was exposed to and inhaled or ingested toxic substances and particulates on all dates at the site(s) indicated above;

Was exposed to and absorbed or touched toxic or caustic substances on all dates at the site(s) indicated above;

Other: Not yet determined.

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

6. Injured Plaintiff

- Has not made a claim to the Victim Compensation Fund. Pursuant to §405(c)(3)(B)(i) of the Air Transportation Safety and System Stabilization Act, 49 U.S.C. § 40101, the issue of waiver is inapplicable.
- Made a claim to the Victim Compensation Fund that was denied. Pursuant to § 405(c)(3)(B)(i) of the Air Transportation Safety and System Stabilization Act, 49 U.S.C. § 40101, the issue of waiver is inapplicable.
- Made a claim to the Victim Compensation Fund, that was subsequently withdrawn by Ground-Zero Plaintiff. Pursuant to § 405(c)(3)(B)(i) of the Air Transportation Safety and System Stabilization Act, 49 U.S.C. § 40101, the issue of waiver is inapplicable.
- Made a claim to the Victim Compensation Fund that was granted. Pursuant to § 405(c)(3)(B)(i) of the Air Transportation Safety and System Stabilization Act, 49 U.S.C. § 40101, Ground Zero-Plaintiff has waived her/his right(s) to pursue any further legal action for the injuries identified in said claim.

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

**B. DEFENDANT(S)**

The following is a list of all Defendant(s) named in the Master Complaint. If checked, all paragraphs pertaining to that Defendant are deemed pleaded herein.

 THE CITY OF NEW YORK

A Notice of Claim was timely filed and served on \_\_\_\_\_ and  
 pursuant to General Municipal Law §50-h the CITY held a hearing on \_\_\_\_\_ (OR)  
 The City has yet to hold a hearing as required by General Municipal Law §50-h  
 More than thirty days have passed and the City has not adjusted the claim  
(OR)  
 An Order to Show Cause application to  
 deem Plaintiff's (Plaintiffs') Notice of Claim timely filed, or in the alternative to grant Plaintiff(s) leave to file a late Notice of Claim *Nunc Pro Tunc* (for leave to file a late Notice of Claim *Nunc Pro Tunc*) has been filed and a determination  
 is pending  
 Granting petition was made on \_\_\_\_\_  
 Denying petition was made on \_\_\_\_\_

 PORT AUTHORITY OF NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY ["PORT AUTHORITY"]

A Notice of Claim was filed and served pursuant to Chapter 179, §7 of The Unconsolidated Laws of the State of New York on  
 More than sixty days have elapsed since the Notice of Claim was filed, (and)  
 the PORT AUTHORITY has adjusted this claim  
 the PORT AUTHORITY has not adjusted this claim.

 1 WORLD TRADE CENTER, LLC

1 WTC HOLDINGS, LLC  
 2 WORLD TRADE CENTER, LLC  
 2 WTC HOLDINGS, LLC  
 4 WORLD TRADE CENTER, LLC  
 4 WTC HOLDINGS, LLC  
 5 WORLD TRADE CENTER, LLC  
 5 WTC HOLDINGS, LLC  
 7 WORLD TRADE COMPANY, L.P.

A RUSSO WRECKING  
 ABM INDUSTRIES, INC.  
 ABM JANITORIAL NORTHEAST, INC.  
 AMEC CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT, INC.  
 AMEC EARTH & ENVIRONMENTAL, INC.  
 ANTHONY CORTESE SPECIALIZED HAULING, LLC, INC.  
 ATLANTIC HEYDT CORP  
 BECHTEL ASSOCIATES PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION  
 BECHTEL CONSTRUCTION, INC.  
 BECHTEL CORPORATION  
 BECHTEL ENVIRONMENTAL, INC.  
 BERKEL & COMPANY, CONTRACTORS, INC.  
 BIG APPLE WRECKING & CONSTRUCTION CORP  
 BOVIS LEND LEASE, INC.  
 BOVIS LEND LEASE LMB, INC.  
 BREEZE CARTING CORP  
 BREEZE NATIONAL, INC.  
 BRER-FOUR TRANSPORTATION CORP.  
 BURO HAPPOLD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.  
 C.B. CONTRACTING CORP  
 CANRON CONSTRUCTION CORP  
 CONSOLIDATED EDISON COMPANY OF NEW YORK, INC.  
 CORD CONTRACTING CO., INC  
 CRAIG TEST BORING COMPANY INC.  
 DAKOTA DEMO-TECH  
 DIAMOND POINT EXCAVATING CORP  
 DIEGO CONSTRUCTION, INC.  
 DIVERSIFIED CARTING, INC.  
 DMT ENTERPRISE, INC.  
 D'ONOFRIO GENERAL CONTRACTORS CORP  
 EAGLE LEASING & INDUSTRIAL SUPPLY  
 EAGLE ONE ROOFING CONTRACTORS INC.  
 EAGLE SCAFFOLDING CO, INC.  
 EJ DAVIES, INC.  
 EN-TECH CORP  
 ET ENVIRONMENTAL  
 EVANS ENVIRONMENTAL

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

EVERGREEN RECYCLING OF CORONA  
 EWELL W. FINLEY, P.C.  
 EXECUTIVE MEDICAL SERVICES, P.C.  
 F&G MECHANICAL, INC.  
 FLEET TRUCKING, INC.  
 FRANCIS A. LEE COMPANY, A CORPORATION  
 FTI TRUCKING  
 GILSANZ MURRAY STEFICEK, LLP  
 GOLDSTEIN ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS, PLLC  
 HALLEN WELDING SERVICE, INC.  
 H.P. ENVIRONMENTAL  
 HUDSON MERIDIAN CONSTRUCTION GROUP, LLC F/K/A MERIDIAN CONSTRUCTION CORP.  
 KOCH SKANSKA INC.  
 LAQUILA CONSTRUCTION INC  
 LASTRADA GENERAL CONTRACTING CORP  
 LESLIE E. ROBERTSON ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEER P.C.  
 LIBERTY MUTUAL GROUP  
 LOCKWOOD KESSLER & BARTLETT, INC.  
 LUCIUS PITKIN, INC  
 LZA TECH-DIV OF THORTON TOMASETTI  
 MANAFORT BROTHERS, INC.  
 MAZZOCCHI WRECKING, INC.  
 MORETRENCH AMERICAN CORP.  
 MRA ENGINEERING P.C.  
 MUESER RUTLEDGE CONSULTING ENGINEERS  
 NACIREMA INDUSTRIES INCORPORATED  
 NEW YORK CRANE & EQUIPMENT CORP.  
 NICHOLSON CONSTRUCTION COMPANY  
 PETER SCALAMANDRE & SONS, INC.  
 PHILLIPS AND JORDAN, INC.  
 PINNACLE ENVIRONMENTAL CORP  
 PLAZA CONSTRUCTION CORP.  
 PRO SAFETY SERVICES, LLC  
 PT & L CONTRACTING CORP  
 REGIONAL SCAFFOLD & HOISTING CO, INC.  
 ROBER SILMAN ASSOCIATES  
 ROBERT L GEROSA, INC  
 RODAR ENTERPRISES, INC.  
 ROYAL GM INC.  
 SAB TRUCKING INC.  
 SAFEWAY ENVIRONMENTAL CORP  
 SEASONS INDUSTRIAL CONTRACTING

SEMCOR EQUIPMENT & MANUFACTURING CORP.  
 SILVERITE CONTRACTING CORPORATION  
 SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES  
 SILVERSTEIN PROPERTIES, INC.  
 SILVERSTEIN WTC FACILITY MANAGER, LLC  
 SILVERSTEIN WTC, LLC  
 SILVERSTEIN WTC MANAGEMENT CO., LLC  
 SILVERSTEIN WTC PROPERTIES, LLC  
 SILVERSTEIN DEVELOPMENT CORP.  
 SILVERSTEIN WTC PROPERTIES LLC  
 SIMPSON GUMPERTZ & HEGER INC  
 SKIDMORE OWINGS & MERRILL LLP  
 SURVIVAIR  
 TAYLOR RECYCLING FACILITY LLC  
 TISHMAN INTERIORS CORPORATION,  
 TISHMAN SPEYER PROPERTIES,  
 TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF MANHATTAN  
 TISHMAN CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION OF NEW YORK  
 THORNTON-TOMASETTI GROUP, INC.  
 TORRETTA TRUCKING, INC  
 TOTAL SAFETY CONSULTING, L.L.C  
 TUCCI EQUIPMENT RENTAL CORP  
 TULLY CONSTRUCTION CO., INC.  
 TULLY ENVIRONMENTAL INC.  
 TULLY INDUSTRIES, INC.  
 TURNER CONSTRUCTION CO.  
 TURNER CONSTRUCTION COMPANY  
 ULTIMATE DEMOLITIONS/CS HAULING  
 VERIZON NEW YORK INC,  
 VOLLMER ASSOCIATES LLP  
 W HARRIS & SONS INC  
 WEEKS MARINE, INC.  
 WEIDLINGER ASSOCIATES, CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C.  
 WHITNEY CONTRACTING INC.  
 WOLKOW-BRAKER ROOFING CORP  
 WORLD TRADE CENTER PROPERTIES, LLC  
 WSP CANTOR SEINUK GROUP  
 YANNUZZI & SONS INC  
 YONKERS CONTRACTING COMPANY, INC.  
 YORK HUNTER CONSTRUCTION, LLC  
 ZIEGENFUSS DRILLING, INC.  
 OTHER: \_\_\_\_\_

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

Non-WTC Site Building Owner

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Business/Service Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Building/Worksite Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-WTC Site Lessee

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Business/Service Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Building/Worksite Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Non-WTC Site Building Managing Agent

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Business/Service Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Building/Worksite Address: \_\_\_\_\_

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

## II. JURISDICTION

The Court's jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action is:

Founded upon Federal Question Jurisdiction; specifically;  Air Transport Safety & System Stabilization Act of 2001, (or);  Federal Officers Jurisdiction, (or);  Other (specify): \_\_\_\_\_;  Contested, but the Court has already determined that it has removal jurisdiction over this action, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441.

## III CAUSES OF ACTION

Plaintiff(s) seeks damages against the above named defendants based upon the following theories of liability, and asserts each element necessary to establish such a claim under the applicable substantive law:

|                                     |   |                                     |  |
|-------------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Breach of the defendants' duties and obligations pursuant to the New York State Labor Law(s) including §§ 200 and 240 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Common Law Negligence, including allegations of Fraud and Misrepresentation  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Breach of the defendants' duties and obligations pursuant to the New York State Labor Law 241(6)                      |                                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Air Quality;<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Effectiveness of Mask Provided;<br><input type="checkbox"/> Effectiveness of Other Safety Equipment Provided |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Pursuant to New York General Municipal Law §205-a   |                                     | (specify: _____);<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other(specify): <u>Not yet determined.</u>  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Pursuant to New York General Municipal Law §205-e   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Wrongful Death   |
|                                     |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Loss of Services/Loss of Consortium for Derivative Plaintiff   |
|                                     |   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Other: _____   |

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

**IV CAUSATION, INJURY AND DAMAGE**

1. As a direct and proximate result of defendant's culpable actions in the rescue and/or recovery and/or construction, renovation, alteration, demolition and all work performed at the premises, the Injured Plaintiff sustained (including, but not limited to) the following injuries:

|                                     |  |                                     |   |
|-------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | Cancer Injury: <u>N/A</u><br>Date of onset: _____<br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: _____   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Cardiovascular Injury: <u>N/A</u><br>Date of onset: _____<br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: _____  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Respiratory Injury: <u>Cough; Dyspnea; Sinus and/or Nasal Problems; Wheezing</u><br>Date of onset: <u>9/16/2006</u><br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: <u>To be supplied at a later date</u>                         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Fear of Cancer<br>Date of onset: <u>9/16/2006</u><br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: <u>To be supplied at a later date</u>  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Digestive Injury: <u>GERD; Stomach Problems, Including, but not limited to, Nausea and/or Acid Reflux</u><br>Date of onset: <u>1/2/2006</u><br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: <u>To be supplied at a later date</u> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Other Injury: <u>Chronic Headaches; Sleeping Problems</u><br>Date of onset: <u>9/16/2006</u><br>Date physician first connected this injury to WTC work: <u>To be supplied at a later date</u> |

*NOTE: The foregoing is NOT an exhaustive list of injuries that may be alleged.*

2. As a direct and proximate result of the injuries identified in paragraph "1 ", above, the Ground Zero-Plaintiff has in the past suffered and/or will in the future suffer the following compensable damages:

=====

- Pain and suffering
- Loss of the enjoyment of life
- Loss of earnings and/or impairment of earning capacity
- Loss of retirement benefits/diminution of retirement benefits
- Expenses for medical care, treatment, and rehabilitation
- Other:
  - Mental anguish
  - Disability
  - Medical monitoring
  - Other: Not yet determined.

*Please read this document carefully.*

*It is very important that you fill out each and every section of this document.*

3.  As a direct and proximate result of the injuries described *supra*, the derivative plaintiff(s), if any, have in the past suffered and/or will in the future suffer a loss of the love, society, companionship, services, affection, and support of the plaintiff and such other losses, injuries and damages for which compensation is legally appropriate.

**WHEREFORE**, plaintiff(s) respectfully pray that the Court enter judgment in his/her/their favor and against defendant(s) for damages, costs of suit and such other, further and different relief as may be just and appropriate.

**Plaintiff(s) demands that all issues of fact in this case be tried before a properly empanelled jury.**

Dated: New York, New York

April 25, 2007

Yours, etc.,

**Worby, Groner Edelman & Napoli Bern, LLP**

Attorneys for Plaintiff(s), Robert Butler and Giovanni Butler

By: 

Christopher R. LoPalo (CL 6466)  
115 Broadway  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10006  
Phone: (212) 267-3700

ATTORNEY VERIFICATION

*CHRISTOPHER R. LOPALO, an attorney at law, duly admitted to practice in the Courts of the State of New York, affirms under the penalties of perjury that:*

*He is the attorney for the plaintiff(s) in the above-entitled action. That he has read the foregoing SUMMONS AND VERIFIED COMPLAINT and knows the contents thereof, and upon information and belief, deponent believes the matters alleged therein to be true.*

*The reason this Verification is made by deponent and not by the plaintiff(s) is that the plaintiff(s) herein reside(s) in a county other than the one in which the plaintiff's attorneys maintain their office.*

*The source of deponent's information and the grounds of his belief are communication, papers, reports and investigation contained in the file.*

*DATED: New York, New York  
April 25, 2007*



*CHRISTOPHER R. LOPALO*

Docket No:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ROBERT BUTLER (AND WIFE, GIOVANNI BUTLER),

Plaintiff(s)  
- against -

A RUSSO WRECKING, ET. AL.,

Defendant(s).

**SUMMONS AND VERIFIED COMPLAINT**

**WORBY GRONER EDELMAN & NAPOLI BERN, LLP**

*Attorneys for: Plaintiff(s)*  
*Office and Post Office Address, Telephone*  
115 Broadway - 12th Floor  
New York, New York 10006  
(212) 267-3700

To  
Attorney(s) for

Service of a copy of the within  
is hereby admitted.

Dated,

\_\_\_\_\_  
Attorney(s) for

**PLEASE TAKE NOTICE:**

**NOTICE OF ENTRY**  
that the within is a (certified) true copy of an  
duly entered in the office of the clerk of the within named court on 20

**NOTICE OF SETTLEMENT**  
that an order \_\_\_\_\_ of which the within is a true copy  
will be presented for settlement to the HON. \_\_\_\_\_ one of the  
judges of the \_\_\_\_\_  
within named Court, at \_\_\_\_\_  
on 20 \_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_ M.  
Dated,

Yours, etc.,  
**WORBY GRONER EDELMAN & NAPOLI BERN, LLP**